The Will of Allah and Our Destiny

Part III: The Position Between the Two Extremes

Vahid Majd

Associate Professor of Tarbiat Modares University

Article acceptance date: June. ۲۰۱۶

Abstract: *In this article, the issue of human will is further discussed. The two different extreme views as well as the rationally moderate and Heavenly accepted view in this issue are provided. It is also shown that the type of view on this issue has direct impact on both beliefs of the unity of Allah and His justice.*

Keywords: *Qadarism, capability, free will, fatalism.*

Qadarism

The term *al-Qadariyya* has been used in our Hadith literature for two extreme groups. The first and the largest group has been the *Jabriyya* that believed in compulsion and maintained that everyone is forced according to the planning and measure (*Taqdir/Qadar*) that Allah ordained, and that His decree is the cause for our actions. The second group was the *Mufawwidha* who believed that Allah does not plan for people and the *Taqdir* of their voluntary actions is relinquished to

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

themselves. The title of the *Qadariyya* has been a notorious one since the Prophet *(PBUH&HF)* severely denounced this group and called them the ditheist (*Majus*) of this nation in numerous traditions.

In the first part of this article, we provided some of the writings of Abul Hasan al-Ash'ari (the famed Bakri theologian), which shows there has been a constant battle between the *Jabriyya* and the *Mufawwidha*, with each one accusing the other of being the *Qadariyya*! On the other hand, the Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* have made it clear that *Qadariyya* contains both the schools of compulsion and independent freedom of will. Towards the end of Part II (published in the previous issue), we provided a tradition which referred to the branch of the *Qadariyya* that believed in compulsion, while the while the following interesting traditions refer to the other branch of *Qadariyya* who believed that Allah has no planning on the human actions. Yunus Ibn Abd al-Rahman narrated:

قَالَ الرِّضَا ع يَا يُونُسُ لَا تَقُلْ بِقَوْلِ الْقَدَرِيَّةِ فَإِنَّ الْقَدَرِيَّةَ لَمْ يَقُولُوا بِقَوْلِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ وَ لَا بِقَوْلِ أَهْلِ النَّارِ وَ لَا بِقَوْلِ إِبْلِيسَ فَإِنَّ أَهْلَ الْجَنَّةِ قَالُوا الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي هَدانا لِهذا- وَ ما كُنَّا لِنَهْتَدِيَ لَوْ لا أَنْ هَدانَا اللَّهُ وَ لَمْ يَقُولُوا بِقَوْلِ أَهْلِ النَّارِ فَإِنَّ أَهْلَ النَّارِ قَالُوا رَبَّنا غَلَبَتْ عَلَيْنا شِقْوَتُنا وَ قَالَ إِبْلِيسَ رَبِّ بِما أَغْوَيْتَنِي فَقُلْتُ يَا سَيِّدِي وَ اللَّهِ مَا أَقُولُ بِقَوْلِهِمْ- وَ لَكِنِّي أَقُولُ لَا يَكُونُ إِلَّا مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَ قَضَى وَ قَدَّرَ- فَقَالَ لَيْسَ هَكَذَا يَا يُونُسُ وَ لَكِنْ لَا يَكُونُ إِلَّا مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ- وَ أَرَادَ وَ قَدَّرَ وَ قَضَى أَ تَدْرِي مَا الْمَشِيَّةُ يَا يُونُسُ قُلْتُ لَا قَالَ هُوَ الذِّكْرُ الْأَوَّلُ- أَ تَدْرِي مَا الْإِرَادَةُ قُلْتُ لَا قَالَ الْعَزِيمَةُ عَلَى مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ- وَ تَدْرِي مَا التَّقْدِيرُ قُلْتُ لَا- قَالَ هُوَ (الْهَنْدَسَةُ و) وَضْعُ الْحُدُودِ مِنَ الْآجَالِ وَ الْأَرْزَاقِ وَ الْبَقَاءِ وَ الْفَنَاءِ- وَ تَدْرِي مَا الْقَضَاءُ قُلْتُ لَا قَالَ هُوَ (الْإِبْرَامُ وَ) إِقَامَةُ الْعَيْنِ.

Imam al-Ridha *(PBUH)* said to me, "O Yunus! Do not maintain the saying of the *Qadariyya*. Certainly, the *Qadariyya* maintain neither the saying of the People of Paradise, nor the (future) saying of the People of the Fire, nor the saying of Satan! Verily, the People of Paradise (shall) say, 'Praise be to Allah who has guided us to this (place). Never could we be guided if Allah would not have guided us.' (٧:٤٣) And the People of Fire (shall) say, 'Our Lord! Our wretchedness overwhelmed us, and we have been misguided folk.' (٢٣:١٠٦) And the Satan said, 'O my Lord! Since you have misled me...' (١٥:٣٩)" I said, "By Allah! I never maintained the saying of the *Qadariyya*. I, too, maintain that nothing exists except that which Allah willed, intended, decreed, and measured." (Here, Yunus made the general mistake of the philosophers who switch the place of plan and measure (*Qadar*) with decree (*Qadhaa*) in the sequence of steps. The Imam *(PBUH)* corrected him as such:) He *(PBUH)* said, "It is not that way! Rather, nothing exists except that which Allah willed, intended, measured (*Qadara*), and decreed (*Qadhaa*). The will is (the

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

creation of) the first attention (concerning a would be thing). The intention is the determination for what He willed. The measure is (the engineering)[١] and setting of the limits such as the appointed time, existence, maintenance, and the extinction (of the would-be action). The decree is (persistence) to make things up and ready (for the person to act).”[٢]

The same Hadith has been reported by different chain of authorities from Imam al-Ridha *(PBUH)*, but with two more tokens (*Ayat*)[٣] of the holy Quran and a divine narration at the end, which are as follows:

يَا يُونُسُ إِنَ الْقَدَرِيَّةَ لَمْ يَقُولُوا بِقَوْلِ اللَّهِ وَ ما تَشاؤُنَ إِلَّا أَنْ يَشاءَ اللَّهُ ... وَ لَا قَالُوا بِقَوْلِ نُوحٍ وَ لا يَنْفَعُكُمْ نُصْحِي إِنْ أَرَدْتُ أَنْ أَنْصَحَ لَكُمْ إِنْ كانَ اللَّهُ يُرِيدُ أَنْ يُغْوِيَكُمْ هُوَ رَبُّكُمْ وَ إِلَيْهِ تُرْجَعُونَ ثُمَّ قَالَ قَالَ اللَّهُ يَا ابْنَ آدَمَ بِمَشِيَّتِي كُنْتَ أَنْتَ الَّذِي تَشَاءُ وَ بِقُوَّتِي أَدَّيْتَ إِلَيَّ فَرَائِضِي وَ بِنِعْمَتِي قَوِيتَ عَلَى مَعْصِيَتِي وَ جَعَلْتُكَ سَمِيعاً بَصِيراً قَوِيّاً فَمَا أَصَابَكَ مِنْ حَسَنَةٍ فَمِنِّي وَ مَا أَصَابَكَ مِنْ سَيِّئَةٍ فَمِنْ نَفْسِكَ وَ ذَلِكَ أَنِّي لَا أُسْأَلُ عَمَّا أَفْعَلُ وَ هُمْ يُسْئَلُونَ ثُمَّ قَالَ قَدْ نَظَمْتُ لَكَ كُلَّ شَيْءٍ تُرِيدُهُ.

Imam al-Ridha *(PBUH)* said, “... O Yunus! Certainly, the *Qadariyya* do not maintain the saying of Allah, ‘And you shall not will unless Allah wills,’ (٨١:٢٩) ... nor do they maintain the saying of Noah (Nuh *(PBUH)*), ‘My advice shall not benefit you even though I intended to advise you if it be that Allah intended to mislead you. He is your Lord and to Him shall you return’ (١١:٣٤).” The Imam continued, “Allah said: ‘O son of Adam! By My will you willed for yourself whatever you willed. By My power were able to perform your obligations to Me. By My bounties and assets you gained power to disobey me. I made you hearing, seeing, and powerful. Thus, whatever goodness reaches you is due to My (mercy), and whatever evil inflicts you is due to your own soul (and your actions). I shall not be questioned for whatever I do, but they shall be questioned.’[٤] Then (the Imam) said, “Certainly, I have put all you wanted (to understand) in the order.”[٥]

It should be noted that the misleading or misguiding attributed to Allah as explained by other tokens of Quran as well as the traditions of Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* is Allah’s punishment for those who insist on rejecting faith. Misguidance is the reverse of guidance, assistance, and light, all of which aid man to choose with better insight. Misguidance is darkness, and a person who makes his choice in darkness, although not deprived of choice, is deprived of insight and is under greater influence of Satan. Such misguidance is not a compulsory misguidance; rather, it is finding oneself free to act in a tricky situation provided as a punishment for what the person has chosen of disbelief earlier. Although he still exercises choice,

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

Allah knows that he will choose wrong under the advisory of Satan. Again, Allah's foreknowledge, His withholding guidance, and His deserting of a disbeliever do not compel him to do wrong, just as His foreknowledge, His guidance, and His assistance do not compel a believer to do right. This issue will be addressed in detail in future parts by will of Allah.

Below is another tradition denouncing the *Qadariyya*. Ali Ibn Salim narrated that Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* said:

إِنَّ الْقَدَرِيَّةَ مَجُوسُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةِ وَ هُمُ الَّذِينَ أَرَادُوا أَنْ يَصِفُوا اللَّهَ بِعَدْلِهِ فَأَخْرَجُوهُ مِنْ سُلْطَانِهِ وَ فِيهِمْ نَزَلَتْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ- يَوْمَ يُسْحَبُونَ فِي النَّارِ عَلى وُجُوهِهِمْ ذُوقُوا مَسَّ سَقَرَ. إِنَّا كُلَّ شَيْءٍ خَلَقْناهُ بِقَدَرٍ.

"Certainly the *Qadariyya* are the ditheists (*Majus*) of this nation. They intended to describe (the actions of) Allah by His justice, but they dismissed Him from His sovereignty. About them, the following tokens were revealed: 'On the Day that they shall be dragged through the Fire on their faces, (they shall be told:) Taste the touch of Hell! Verily, We have created everything (including this punishment) according to a measure (*Qadar*).' (٥٤:٤٨-٤٩)"[٦]

The following tradition dismisses compulsion due to Allah's will. Imam Hasan al-Askari *(PBUH)* narrated that Imam Musa Ibn Ja'far *(PBUH)* said:

إِنَ اللَّهَ خَلَقَ الْخَلْقَ فَعَلِمَ مَا هُمْ إِلَيْهِ صَائِرُونَ فَأَمَرَهُمْ وَ نَهَاهُمْ فَمَا أَمَرَهُمْ بِهِ مِنْ شَيْءٍ فَقَدْ جَعَلَ لَهُمُ السَّبِيلَ إِلَى الْأَخْذِ بِهِ وَ مَا نَهَاهُمْ عَنْهُ مِنْ شَيْءٍ فَقَدْ جَعَلَ لَهُمُ السَّبِيلَ إِلَى تَرْكِهِ وَ لَا يَكُونُونَ آخِذِينَ وَ لَا تَارِكِينَ إِلَّا بِإِذْنِهِ وَ مَا جَبَرَ اللَّهُ أَحَداً مِنْ خَلْقِهِ عَلَى مَعْصِيَتِهِ بَلِ ابْتَبَرَهُمْ بِالْبَلْوَى وَ كَمَا قَالَ لِيَبْلُوَكُمْ أَيُّكُمْ أَحْسَنُ عَمَلا.

"Certainly Allah created the creation and knew to what they will turn. Then, He commanded and forbade them. However, to whatever He commanded, He has indeed made for them a way to take, and from whatever He forbade them, He has certainly made for them a way to avoid. Nevertheless, they shall neither take nor leave except by His permission. Yet, Allah never compelled anyone of His creations to His disobedience, but rather He put them in trial He stated, 'in order to test you (to make for everyone clear) which of you is best in terms of deed.' (٦٧:٢)"[٧]

Again, pointing to the domain of our volition, Hisham Ibn Salim narrated that Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* said:

اللَّهُ أَكْرَمُ مِنْ أَنْ يُكَلِّفَ النَّاسَ مَا لاَ يُطِيقُونَ وَ اللَّهُ أَعَزُّ مِنْ أَنْ يَكُونَ فِي سُلْطَانِهِ مَا لاَ يُرِيدُ.

"Allah is more generous than charging people with what they cannot bear. Yet, Allah is mightier than having something

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

He did not intend, take place in His kingdom."[٨]

The above Hadith clearly dismisses both the idea of compulsion and independent freedom in our actions. Believing compulsion dismisses the justice of Allah and nullifies His commandments, prohibitions, rewards, and punishments. One the other hand, believing independent and uncontrolled will for man, nullifies the lordship of Allah. These facts are also emphasized by the following Hadith. Various traditionists narrated that Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* said:

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ يَأْمُرُ بِالسُّوءِ وَ الْفَحْشَاءِ فَقَدْ كَذَبَ عَلَى اللَّهِ وَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ الْخَيْرَ وَ الشَّرَّ بِغَيْرِ مَشِيئَةِ اللَّهِ فَقَدْ أَخْرَجَ اللَّهَ مِنْ سُلْطَانِهِ وَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ الْمَعَاصِيَ بِغَيْرِ قُوَّةِ اللَّهِ فَقَدْ كَذَبَ عَلَى اللَّهِ وَ مَنْ كَذَبَ عَلَى اللَّهِ أَدْخَلَهُ اللَّهُ النَّارَ

The Messenger of Allah *(PBUH&HF)* said, "He who thinks Allah commands to evil (*al-Soo'*) and indecent deeds, has indeed lied about Allah. He who thinks the goodness (*al-Khair*) and the evil (*al-Sharr*) are not according to His will, has dismissed Allah from His Sovereignty. He who thinks that sins are performed by other than the power created by Allah has indeed lied about Allah. And he who lies about Allah, Allah shall enter him the Fire."[٩]

Capability

For a human to act or avoid a certain action, he or she needs a capability (*al-Istita'a*) empowered by Allah. This capability of manifesting one's volition is only given instantaneously at the time of action or avoidance, and is only good for a certain place at a certain time. For other instances of time and place, Allah may or may not reinstate such capability based on His will. This is because Allah does not relinquish His authority to people, and nothing takes place among His creation except by His instantaneous permission. Salih al-Nili narrated:

سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع هَلْ لِلْعِبَادِ مِنَ الِاسْتِطَاعَةِ شَيْءٌ قَالَ فَقَالَ لِي إِذَا فَعَلُوا الْفِعْلَ كَانُوا مُسْتَطِيعِينَ بِالِاسْتِطَاعَةِ الَّتِي جَعَلَهَا اللَّهُ فِيهِمْ قَالَ قُلْتُ وَ مَا هِيَ قَالَ الْآلَةُ مِثْلُ الزَّانِي إِذَا زَنَى كَانَ مُسْتَطِيعاً لِلزِّنَا حِينَ زَنَى وَ لَوْ أَنَّهُ تَرَكَ الزِّنَا وَ لَمْ يَزْنِ كَانَ مُسْتَطِيعاً لِتَرْكِهِ إِذَا تَرَكَ قَالَ ثُمَّ قَالَ لَيْسَ لَهُ مِنَ الِاسْتِطَاعَةِ قَبْلَ الْفِعْلِ قَلِيلٌ وَ لاَ كَثِيرٌ وَ لَكِنْ مَعَ الْفِعْلِ وَ التَّرْكِ كَانَ مُسْتَطِيعاً قُلْتُ فَعَلَى مَا ذَا يُعَذِّبُهُ قَالَ بِالْحُجَّةِ الْبَالِغَةِ وَ الْآلَةِ الَّتِي رَكَّبَ فِيهِمْ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَمْ يُجْبِرْ أَحَداً عَلَى مَعْصِيَتِهِ وَ لاَ أَرَادَ إِرَادَةَ حَتْمٍ الْكُفْرَ مِنْ أَحَدٍ وَ لَكِنْ حِينَ كَفَرَ كَانَ فِي إِرَادَةِ اللَّهِ أَنْ يَكْفُرَ وَ هُمْ فِي إِرَادَةِ اللَّهِ وَ فِي عِلْمِهِ أَنْ لاَ يَصِيرُوا إِلَى شَيْءٍ مِنَ الْخَيْرِ قُلْتُ أَرَادَ مِنْهُمْ أَنْ يَكْفُرُوا قَالَ لَيْسَ هَكَذَا أَقُولُ وَ لَكِنِّي أَقُولُ عَلِمَ أَنَّهُمْ سَيَكْفُرُونَ فَأَرَادَ الْكُفْرَ لِعِلْمِهِ فِيهِمْ وَ لَيْسَتْ هِيَ إِرَادَةَ حَتْمٍ إِنَّمَا هِيَ إِرَادَةُ اخْتِيَارٍ

I asked Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* if there is anything of capability (*al-Istita'a*) for the

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

servants. He *(PBUH)* replied, "If they performed the action (it shows that) they were capable by the capability that Allah placed in them." I asked, "What is it?" He *(PBUH)* replied, "It is the means (of action). ... There is nothing of capability—neither little nor big—before the time of the action. One becomes capable (for a specific action) only at the time of acting or avoiding." I said, "Then on what basis does Allah punish him?" He *(PBUH)* replied, "By what has reached him of evidence and by the means (i.e., capability) that was (instantaneously) placed in him. Certainly, Allah does not compel anyone to His disobedience and does not coercively intend disbelief for anyone. However, when one becomes a disbeliever, it was (already) in the intention of Allah and His knowledge that he will disbelieve and that he will not turn to any goodness." I asked, "Did Allah want them to disbelieve?" He *(PBUH)* said, "I did not say that. I rather say He knew they would soon disbelieve, and thus, He intended disbelief due to His foreknowledge about them. This is not coercive intention (i.e., it is not the cause for their action and is not compelling them). It is just volitive intention (i.e., intention of giving permission to their choice)."[١٠]

Other than, people's actions, Allah intends His own action. Coercive intention (*Iradat al-Hatm*) of Allah is only limited to some of Allah's actions. What Allah wants to do (as His own action) becomes indispensable and is forced on the creation. Such an action is not the action of human; rather, it may be certain goal or custom of Allah for His creation, and is His punishment or His reward of people's action. However, volitive intention (*Iradat al-Ikhtiyar*) of Allah is related to what Allah intended to permit some of people's choice for which He provides them of capability at the moment of their action. Thus, when Allah states in the holy Quran:

وَ مَا اَللَّهُ يُرِيدُ ظُلْماً لِلْعِبادِ وَ مَا اَللَّهُ يُرِيدُ ظُلْماً لِلْعالَمِينَ

"***Allah never intends injustice to His servants,"*** (٤٠:٣١) and ***"Allah never intends injustice to the worlds,"*** (٣:١٠٨)

the intention that is denied here is the intention of coercion or imposition because it is concerned with His own action. In other words, Allah does not impose injustice to people, and therefore, injustice is not the action of Allah. However, the injustice imposed by some people over others is in His will and His intention of (permitting) choice. Allah intended to give permission to the occurrence of some (not all) injustice by people. As such, although injustice by others is in His intention, it cannot be considered His action or His imposition.

The above Hadith also clearly disproves the idea of the *Mufawwidha* who claim

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

that since human feels he has power, he can do what he wants by means of that power at any time. They have neglected the fact that Allah grants human capability for an action moment by moment according to His will. Although human may feel to have power, he cannot use it for an action that Allah did not intend to happen. The capability of using power is granted exactly to the extent of carrying out human's choice of action at a certain time. That certain capability is no good for use at another instant of time and need to be reinstated by Allah. Many traditions, however, state that the capability (*al-Istita'a*) is before the action. This conflict can be easily resolved by observing that the order of capability is prior to the action, but it comes to existence at the time of action. The similitude of the capability to the action is the similitude of a hand that turns a key. The hand turns exactly at the time that the key turns, but the hand has order priority in the action of turning. Thus, although capability is the prerequisite of an action, it is manifested at the time of the action by will of Allah. Anyone who claims that he will have the capability to do a certain act one moment later, he implies that Allah has relinquished His authority (*Tafwidh*). Our capability of using power is provisional and Allah may discontinue granting it at any moment if He wills. Since we do not know if Allah permits us to perform a certain act even one moment later, we should always make an exception for the will of Allah in our future decisions. Allah says in the holy Quran:

وَ لا تَقُولَنَّ لِشَيْءٍ إِنِّي فاعِلٌ ذلِكَ غَداً إِلاَّ أَنْ يَشاءَ اَللَّهُ.

Nor say about anything, "I shall surely do that tomorrow" (unless you say) "except if Allah wills (otherwise)." (١٨:٢٣-٢٤)

The Position Between the Two

The viewpoint taken by Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* in this regard falls between the two extremes discussed earlier. However, many people who regard the saying of Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* have still misconception on what exactly the middle position is. Some wrongly interpret the middle position as the combination of the two extreme views. In other words, they claim that we are forced in some actions and are left free in some other actions. Some believe in partial freedom and partial coercion in all human actions. Both interpretations are wrong and negate reason as well as the Hadith.

On the commentary of the famous Hadith of Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)*, *"a position between the two extreme positions"*, Yazid Ibn Umair narrated:

دَخَلْتُ عَلَى عَلِيِ بْنِ مُوسَى الرِّضَا ع بِمَرْوَ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ رُوِيَ لَنَا عَنِ الصَّادِقِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ ع أَنَّهُ قَالَ لَا جَبْرَ وَ لَا تَفْوِيضَ بَلْ أَمْرٌ بَيْنَ أَمْرَيْنِ فَمَا مَعْنَاهُ فَقَالَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ يَفْعَلُ أَفْعَالَنَا ثُمَّ يُعَذِّبُنَا عَلَيْهَا فَقَدْ قَالَ

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

بِالْجَبْرِ وَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فَوَّضَ أَمْرَ الْخَلْقِ وَ الرِّزْقِ إِلَى حُجَجِهِ ع فَقَدْ قَالَ بِالتَّفْوِيضِ فَالْقَائِلُ بِالْجَبْرِ كَافِرٌ وَ الْقَائِلُ بِالتَّفْوِيضِ مُشْرِكٌ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَمَا أَمْرٌ بَيْنَ أَمْرَيْنِ فَقَالَ وُجُودُ السَّبِيلِ إِلَى إِتْيَانِ مَا أُمِرُوا بِهِ وَ تَرْكِ مَا نُهُوا عَنْهُ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ فَهَلْ لِلَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ مَشِيَّةٌ وَ إِرَادَةٌ فِي ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ أَمَّا الطَّاعَاتُ فَإِرَادَةُ اللَّهِ وَ مَشِيَّتُهُ فِيهَا الْأَمْرُ بِهَا وَ الرِّضَا لَهَا وَ الْمُعَاوَنَةُ عَلَيْهَا وَ إِرَادَتُهُ وَ مَشِيَّتُهُ فِي الْمَعَاصِي النَّهْيُ عَنْهَا وَ السَّخَطُ لَهَا وَ الْخِذْلَانُ عَلَيْهَا قُلْتُ فَلِلَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فِيهَا الْقَضَاءُ- قَالَ نَعَمْ مَا مِنْ فِعْلٍ يَفْعَلُهُ الْعِبَادُ مِنْ خَيْرٍ وَ شَرٍّ إِلَّا وَ لِلَّهِ فِيهِ قَضَاءٌ قُلْتُ فَمَا مَعْنَى هَذَا الْقَضَاءِ قَالَ الْحُكْمُ عَلَيْهِمْ بِمَا يَسْتَحِقُّونَهُ عَلَى أَفْعَالِهِمْ مِنَ الثَّوَابِ وَ الْعِقَابِ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَ الْآخِرَةِ.

I said to Ali Ibn Musa al-Ridha *(PBUH)*, "O Son of the Messenger of Allah! It has been narrated to us that Ja'far Ibn Muhammad al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* said, 'There is no compulsion (*Jabr*) and no relinquishment (*Tafwidh*), but something between the two.' What does this mean?" Imam al-Ridha *(PBUH)* replied, "He who claims that Allah commits our actions and then punishes us for those (actions), has indeed maintained compulsion (*Jabr*). On the other hand, he who claims that Allah has relinquished the authority of creation and sustenance to His proofs *(PBUH)* has indeed maintained relinquishment (*Tafwidh* to the Imams). The supporter of compulsion is a disbeliever and the supporter of relinquishing authority (to people) is a polytheist." I then asked, "O son of the Messenger of Allah! What is the position between the two?" The Imam *(PBUH)* replied, "The existence of *the path* for performing what was ordered and for leaving what was prohibited." I asked, "Is there any will and intention for Allah on this?" He *(PBUH)* said, "As for the acts of obedience, the intention and will of Allah is His command (to the servants) to act upon them, His satisfaction with those actions, and His aid (to the person) to accomplish them. On the other hand, His intention and will in sins is His prohibition, His wrath for committing such actions, and His deserting and forsaking them over those actions (i.e., leaving people on those actions without pushing them)." I asked, "Is there any decree (*Qadhaa*) for Allah on these acts?" He *(PBUH)* said, "Yes, There does not exist any act that the servants do, be it good (*Khair*) or evil (*Sharr*), except that Allah has a decree on it." I asked, "Then what is the meaning of the decree here?" He *(PBUH)* said, "The verdict on them for that which they deserve from rewards and punishments in this world and the Hereafter (for that action)."[١١]

In the above Hadith, the Imam *(PBUH)* referred to Allah's will and intention of commandment and satisfaction as well as His decree (*Qadhaa*) of judgment. The Hadith is quiet concerning the will and intention of knowledge that pertains to let an action take place.

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

The above Hadith also points to a subgroup of *al-Mufawwidha* who believed that Allah has relinquished authority specifically to the Imams *(PBUT)* and believed that the Imam's *(PBUH)* will is independent of Allah's will. (The issue of the will of Imam *(PBUH)* will be discussed in future parts). In other words, even if one believes that Allah did not relinquish His authority over his free actions, he is still considered among the *Mufawwidha* if he claim such an independent authority for Allah's best creation, i.e., the divinely appointed Imam. Nothing among the creations of Allah is left uncontrolled, autonomous, and independent because it implies Allah has withdrawn from His lordship (*al-Rububiyya*).

The fact that we have no choice over some of the things that happens to us is not denied by any group, including the *Mufawwidha*. All the arguments in the entire history of mankind have been concerned about the actions that we do voluntarily. As discussed earlier, only our voluntary actions can be really considered as our actions.

The famous saying of Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* concerning the fact that human will is between the two extremes, clearly does not mean that some of our actions are due to compulsion (*Jabr*) and some are due to independent and uncontrolled freedom of will (*Tafwidh*). This is because in that case, any single action has either the problem of compulsion or the problem of independence in Allah's kingdom. The Imam *(PBUH)* rather pointed out to the domain of our volition and stated that neither we are coerced in any of our actions nor are we left uncontrolled and unsupervised in any of our decisions and actions.

Moreover, there cannot be "partial compulsion" or "partial volition" in our actions. Volition must be complete in a certain action; otherwise, there is no volition in that action.

We are completely free in our choice of action once Allah permits our choice beforehand. What we freely choose is in conformity with what Allah already allowed of our free will. Therefore, His will administers the domain of our freedom without making us compelled in our own actions anyway.

The Necessity of Belief that the Will of Allah is Created

In many traditions, the Imams of Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* stressed the fact that the will of Allah (*Mashiyya*), His intention (*Irada*), planning and apportionment of time, place, and other quantities (*Qadar*), and decree (*Qadhaa*) are all His creations, and that anyone who thinks they are eternal or the same as His Essence (*Dhat*), is a disbeliever and a polytheist. This is because Allah's intention does not refer to Him but refers to the intended things (i.e.,

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

His creations), which are many. The multitude of eternal intentions would defy the oneness of Allah and His Eternity. Thus, His intentions cannot be eternal. This makes belief in the novelty of the will of Allah a necessary requirement for monotheism, other than the fact that it is required for the justice of Allah as discussed before.

Eternal intention means an intention that existed with Allah eternally. By claiming eternal intention for Allah, one is implying that it is the same as the Essence of Allah or else it is co-eternal with Allah. The former claim implies the Essence of Allah has numerous parts due to the variety of intentions (which, in turn, refer to the variety of intended things). The latter implies the existence of some objects that are co-eternal. This would limit Allah by its counterparts and negate the fact that He is the creator of everything. Both cases negate the oneness of Allah, and that nothing is like Him. Moreover, changes in the intended things show changes in Allah's intention based on time. If the will and intention are of His Essence, changes in the intention would require changes in Allah which implies Allah Himself is created. Sulaiman Ibn Ja'far al-Ja'fari narrated Imam al-Ridha *(PBUH)* said:

الْمَشِيئَةُ (وَ الإِرادَةُ) مِنْ صِفَاتِ الأَفْعَالِ فَمَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ لَمْ يَزَلْ مُرِيداً شَائِياً فَلَيْسَ بِمُوَحِّدٍ .

"The will and the intention are of the attributes of actions. Thus, he who thinks that Allah eternally intended and willed is not a monotheist."[١٢]

It is also narrated that Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* said:

كَانَ اللَّهُ وَ هُوَ لَا يُرِيدُ بِلَا عَدَدٍ أَكْثَرَ مِمَّا كَانَ مُرِيداً.

"Allah existed while He did not intend countless number of times more than what He (later) intended."[١٣]

The countless number of unintended matters refers to the knowledge of what was not permitted to happen, or equivalently, the knowledge of unseen (*Ilm al-Ghaib*), which will be adressed in later parts. In addition, Asim Ibn Hamid narrated:

عَنْ عَاصِمِ بْنِ حُمَيْدٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ قُلْتُ لَمْ يَزَلِ اللَّهُ مُرِيداً قَالَ إِنَّ الْمُرِيدَ لاَ يَكُونُ إِلاَّ لِمُرَادٍ مَعَهُ لَمْ يَزَلِ اللَّهُ عَالِماً قَادِراً ثُمَّ أَرَادَ .

I asked Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)* whether Allah intended eternally. He *(PBUH)* replied, "Certainly, the one who intends (something) is with what was intended. Allah eternally knew and was eternally powerful. He then intended (i.e., created the action of intention)."[١٤]

Concerning the Eternal knowledge, and that one should rationally regard Allah

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

pure from ignorance, please refer to the detailed discussion in the previous part.

Believing that the will and intention of Allah are created, has turned to one of the clear signs that distinguish the true followers of Ahl al-Bayt *(PBUT)* from all other deviants. These include the *Bakri's* which consist of the mainstream *Ash'ari* faction who believe in compulsion, and the nearly extinct *Mu'tazili* faction who believed in the independent freedom of will. It also include almost all the philosophers in Islam as well as mystical variants of Islam (regardless of their claim to be *Shia* or *Bakri*) which are all essentially believe in compulsion.

Conclusion

In this article, we discussed the two opposite extreme views in the issue of the will of mankind, both of which have been known as *al-Qadariyya*. Then, we discussed the capability that is required to act and to exercise one's choice. We also clarified the rationally and religiously orthodox position on human will, which falls between the two opposite extreme positions of free will and fatalism. The middle position rationally requires the will, intention, planning, and decree of the creator to be created; otherwise, Allah Himself becomes created entity.

In the next part of this article, by will of Allah, we will address the notion of *al-Badaa*, which is the origination of a new will by Allah, and will explain it in the light of the holy Quran as interpreted by the Messenger of Allah *(PBUH&HF)* and the divinely appointed leaders *(PBUT)* after him.

[١] According to the version of Hadith given in al-Kafi, vo. ١, p. ١٥٧, Hadith ٤.

[٢] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ٥, p. ١١٤, Hadith ٤٩, cited from *Tafsir* 'Ali Ibn Ibrahim al-Qumi.

[٣] The plural of Ayah, meaning, divine sign, evidence, or token, which refers to each small segment of the holy Quran. It is commonly mistranslated as "verse" imitating the way the Christians behave the tokens of the Bible. Allah states in the holy Quran that, "We have not taught him any verse or poem, nor would it befit him. It is merely a reminder and an evident Quran." (٣٦:٩٦)

[٤] Referring to Token ٣٣ of Chapter ٢١ of the holy Quran.

[٥] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ٥, p. ١٢٢, Hadith ٨٩, cited from *al-Mahasin*.

[٦] *Al-Tawhid*, p. ٣٨٢, Hadith ٢٩; Similar narrations were reported from the Commander of Faithful, Imam 'Ali *(PBUH)*, Imam al-Baqir *(PBUH)*, and Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)*. See *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ٥, pp ١١٧-١١٨, Hadith ٥٠, ٥١, & ٥٤.

[٧] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ٥, p. ٢٦, Hadith ٣٢, cited from *al-Ihtijaj*; a similar narration

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]

from Imam al-Sadiq *(PBUH)*) is reported in *al-Kafi*, vol. ١, p. ١٥٨, Hadith ٥.

[٨] *al-Kafi*, vol. ١, p. ١۶٠, Hadith ١۴.

[٩] *al-Kafi*, vol. ١, p. ١٥٨, Hadith ۶.

[١٠] *al-Kafi*, vol. ١, p. ١۶٣, Hadith ٣.

[١١] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ٥, pp. ١١-١٣, Hadith ١٨, cited from *'Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha (PBUH)*.

[١٢] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ۴, p. ١۴٥, Hadith ١٨, cited from al-Tawhid.

[١٣] *Bihar al-Anwar*, vol. ۴, p. ١۴٥, Hadith ١٧.

[١۴] *al-Kafi*, vol. ١, p. ١٠٩, Hadith ١.

[Downloaded from mail.safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-19]